

Oral defense question set — process integrity sample

Use these questions after AI-assisted draft marking to confirm the student understands their own argument — not to catch cheating with a detector score.

Essay context: Persuasive essay — Should phones be banned during school hours? (anonymized Student A demo)

1. Thesis & scope (high)

In your own words, what is your main position on phone use during school hours — and what did you deliberately exclude from scope?

Teacher script: Ask the student to state the thesis without reading. Follow up: "What would change your mind?"

Why: Confirms the writer owns the central claim rather than pasting a generic introduction.

Draft link: Opening sentence states ban during class time only, not outside school.

2. Evidence integration (high)

You cited improved recycling rates — how does that statistic support your argument about phones in classrooms?

Teacher script: If they cannot explain the link, ask them to identify which paragraph the statistic appears in and what claim it supports.

Why: Quote-anchored verification — checks they understand evidence they allegedly integrated.

Draft link: Recycling rates paragraph on page 2 — thin analysis flagged in marking report.

3. Counterargument (medium)

What is the strongest objection a parent might raise to your position, and how did you respond to it in the draft?

Teacher script: Listen for a specific rebuttal, not "people disagree." Prompt: "Where in your essay did you address that?"

Why: Process integrity — persuasive writing requires engaging an opposing view, not only asserting a stance.

Draft link: Paragraph 3 mentions disagreement but lacks developed rebuttal (-2 on thesis criterion).

4. Revision plan (medium)

If you had ten more minutes, which single paragraph would you rewrite first and why?

Teacher script: Accept any reason tied to rubric feedback. Note whether they reference marker comments or only surface edits.

Why: Closes the loop between draft feedback and student agency — supports remediation without a detection score.
